A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF GLOBALIZATION IMPACTS ON HIGHER EDUCATION IN HONG KONG AND SINGAPORE
全球化對香港及新加坡高等教育影響之比較研究

Submitted to
Department of Public and Social Administration
公共及社會行政學系
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Philosophy
哲學碩士學位

by

Lee Hiu Hong
李曉康

January 2003
二零零三年一月
Abstract

This research compares and examines the impacts of higher education policy changes and reforms on stakeholders of the university sector in Hong Kong and Singapore in the context of the global economy. In recent years, higher education has weathered unprecedented changes when it has been overwhelmed by massification, growing social demands for financial and managerial accountability, and tremendous pressure for achieving efficiency, cost-effectiveness and quality. The current higher education reforms have put more emphasis on transforming universities to be more like global knowledge enterprises in order to cope with rapid changes and challenges in the knowledge-based economy. Teaching, research, institutional governance and management, finance, and the relationships between government and universities have been affected profoundly by the latest changes and developments of higher education reforms, which assume that universities are not only cultural and scholastic organizations for the interest of the academic profession but also public service institutions responsive to socio-economic demands. The idea of collegiality, which concerns more on equality, consensus and autonomy, is threatened by the rise of managerialism that the notions of efficiency, cost-effectiveness, good management, and accountability are advocated. A paradigm shift from collegiality to managerialism happens in tandem with the three ideologies prevailing in the university sector, namely, economic rationalism, academic capitalism and corporate managerialism. In spite of facing similar forces of change for the higher education systems in Hong Kong and Singapore, their practitioners and stakeholders are responding differently to recent policy changes and reforms because of their unique political, social and economic backgrounds.
Contents

Abstract ii
Acknowledgments iii
List of Tables vii
List of Figures viii

Introduction 1
The Setting 1
The Context of Higher Education Reform 5
Reform Background 5
Higher Education Reform and Public Sector Reform 7
Three Ideologies in Higher Education Reform 13
Higher Education Development in Hong Kong and Singapore 19
Higher Education Development in Hong Kong 19
Higher Education Development in Singapore 24
Research Issues 27
Structure of the Thesis 30

Chapter One: Analytical Framework: Globalization, Managerialism and Higher Education 31
Higher Education and Globalization 31
The Concept 32
The Debate 36
Towards Educational Globalization? 39
Three Levels of a Higher Education System 42
The Concept and Dimensions of Change in Higher Education 44
Analytical Frameworks: Changing State and Higher Education 49
The Clark Framework 50
The van Vught Framework 55
The McNay Framework 57
The Bauer Framework 61
The Braun and Merrien Framework 63
An Analytical Framework of Higher Education Governance 66
The Conclusion to Chapter One 69

Chapter Two: Methodology 70
Purpose 71
Philosophical Basis 74
Positivism 75
Functionalism 75
Institutionalism 76
Approach 78
Methods 79
Literature Review and Documentary Analysis 80
In-depth Interviews and Sampling 80
The Conclusion to Chapter One 84
Chapter Three: Higher Education Developments and Policies

Historical Development of Higher Education
Higher Education Institutions
Governing Authorities

Changes in Higher Education Policy
Massification
Economic Instrumentalism and Managerialism
The Quest for Quality

Comparison
Similarities
Divergences
Summary

The Conclusion to Chapter Three

Chapter Four: Reform Measures and Strategies

Quality Assurance Movement
Hong Kong
Singapore
Summary

Diversification of University Funding
Hong Kong
Singapore
Summary

The Rise of Private University
Hong Kong
Singapore
Summary

Comprehensive Reviews of University Education
Hong Kong
Singapore
Summary

Comparison
Similarities
Divergences

The Conclusion to Chapter Four

Chapter Five: Responses to Higher Education Reforms

A Review of the Analytical Framework

Responses at the Macro-level
Findings on Reform Policies
Findings on State-University Relationships
Summary

Responses at the Meso-level
Findings on Quality Assurance
Findings on Marketization
Summary

Responses at the Micro-level
Findings on Academic Work
Summary

Comparison of the Responses to Higher Education Reforms
Similarities
Divergences
Summary

The Conclusion to Chapter Five
Conclusion
   The Impacts of Globalization on Higher Education 219
   Managerialization and Entrepreneurialization 220
   Centralized Decentralization 221
   Changes in State-University Relationship 222
   Summary 223
   Limitations of the Research 224
   Future Research Agendas 225

Bibliography 226

Appendix: List of Interviewees 227
List of Tables

Table 1  Three tendencies in the globalization debate  38
Table 2  Three levels in the higher education system  43
Table 3  Different types/modes of change in higher education  46
Table 4  Comparison of Hong Kong and Singapore’s policy-borrowing examples  55
Table 5  Controls and cultures in education institutions  58
Table 6  Four typologies of state governance and degrees of institutional autonomy  61
Table 7  Governance models  64
Table 8  A summary of McNay, Bauer, and Braun and Merrien’s Frameworks  67
Table 9  Comparing factors affecting higher education in Hong Kong and Singapore  124
Table 10 General statistics on university education in Hong Kong (1990/91-2001/02)  127
Table 11 General statistics on higher (university & polytechnic) education in Singapore (1987-89, 1992-2001)  128
Table 12 University governance models: Comparing Hong Kong and Singapore  173
Table 13 Comparison of the responses to higher education reforms  216
List of Figures

Figure 1  Forces of change in higher education  48
Figure 2  A triangle of coordination  50
Figure 3  The movement of four higher education systems  52
Figure 4  State control and state supervisory models  57
Figure 5  Controls and cultures in education institutions  58
Figure 6  Four typologies of state governance and degrees of institutional autonomy  62
Figure 7  Governance models  65
Figure 8  Steps of comparative analysis on education  85
Figure 9  Interactions between universities and other educational institutions in Singapore  163
Figure 10  Projected 3-tier university system in Singapore  164
Figure 11  Governance models with Hong Kong and Singapore’s trajectories  174