NATIONAL ELITE MEDIA DISCOURSES ON GLOBALIZATION: COMPARING CHINA WITH INDIA

SONG JING

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
CITY UNIVERSITY OF HONG KONG
JANUARY 2010
National Elite Media Discourses on Globalization:
Comparing China with India

Submitted to
Department of Media and Communication
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

By Song Jing

January, 2010
Abstract

In the age of globalization, nation states have to negotiate with the neo-liberal world order, articulating national interest on the one hand and preserving national identity and sovereignty on the other. National media draw a world map for ordinary people and explain the relationship between globalization and their lives. Therefore one important way of examining the international discursive contestation is to look through national media’s prisms to explore how the state acts as the repository of national interest. Chinese and Indian elite media discourses offer an illuminating pair for case comparison. This study attempts to investigate the differences between national media construction of globalization in China and India.

Theoretically, this thesis argues that national media discursive construction is shaped and influenced by the national interest as defined by state elites located in a larger international political economy. Empirically, this study compared 1,004 editorials of three national newspapers-- the People’s Daily, the Global Times, and the Hindu-- from 1996 to 2006. Besides, 185 editorials from 2000 to 2006 from the Times of India were included for further comparison. Content analysis and discourse analysis were applied; the former acts as the prelude to the latter. This study aimed to answer three research questions. (1) What is China and India located in the international political economy? (2) How do Chinese and Indian media construct globalization in line with these contexts? (3) What explain the similarities and differences in their media constructions?

Content analysis revealed that the media in the two countries take a positive attitude towards globalization. Two media frames were prominent in referencing “globalization:” namely, the “Interest” frame and the “Identity” frame. According to the two frames, I unpacked globalization into four issues: the international issues and the benefit-cost in the neo-liberal world order; the domestic conflicts and the contestation among various groups within state; the continuity and discontinuity between history and globalization; the boundary of the “other” and “us” and the construction of the others.

The study finds that the Chinese media believe that China should accommodate to the global world in terms of economic development, but politically to fight against western hegemony to preserve China’s autonomy and legitimacy. The Indian media focus
more on military and security issues in the region and sub-continent; they hold a more critical attitude towards the international trade order than do the Chinese media. On the internal conflict issues that may arise from globalization, the Chinese media deemphasize the ill effects of globalization on disadvantaged groups; they emphasize overall national interests rather than specific interest of civil society and the people. The Indian media criticize the government for policy failure, where globalization is concerned, to take care of bad influences on people’s lives.

The study also finds that the Chinese media emphasize the historical continuity as if globalization provides a golden opportunity for China’s rise to great-power status and to revive the past glory of Chinese civilization. In contrast, the Indian media emphasize the historical discontinuity and seldom refer to the splendid Indian history. At the same time, the Chinese media accept the U.S.’s domination in the global trade and economic system, and overlook the role of other developing countries. The Indian media mainly criticize the U.S. for hurting India’s economy and military security, but hold a mixed feeling toward other third world countries.

The study concludes that the Chinese and Indian media apply different frames in globalization discourse. The Chinese media approach globalization issues mainly in an interest frame, paying attention to economic development which can bolster elite power and save the Party from legitimacy crisis. The Indian media’s construction of globalization is more identity-based and critical-oriented. China’s economic reform has produced wealth for the elite, strengthened the regime’s legitimacy, and stimulated national pride. In contrast, the Indian government’s neoliberal policies are more often criticized because the ambivalent colonial history has shaped an uncertain national identity, and thus an ambiguous media attitude towards globalization.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................................................. II

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .......................................................................................................................... IV

TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................................................................... VI

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES .......................................................................................................... IX

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................ 1

1.1 MAKING SENSE OF GLOBALIZATION: SETTING THE STAGE ................................................ 2

1.1.1 Globalization and Neoliberalism ............................................................................................... 2

1.1.2 Nation States in Globalization ................................................................................................... 4

1.1.3 Definition of Globalization ......................................................................................................... 9

1.2 CHINA, INDIA, AND GLOBALIZATION .................................................................................... 10

1.2.1 Juxtaposing the Two States ....................................................................................................... 11

1.2.2 Different States, Different Politics .............................................................................................. 14

1.3 OUTLINE OF THE CHAPTERS ................................................................................................ 23

CHAPTER 2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHOD ........................................................... 26

2.1 TWO FRAMES IN GLOBALIZATION DISCOURSE .................................................................... 26

2.1.1 Framing Theory and Categories of Frames ............................................................................ 26

2.1.2 The Interest Frame ..................................................................................................................... 28

2.1.3 The Identity Frame .................................................................................................................... 32

2.1.4 Outline of the Two Frames ....................................................................................................... 36

2.2 METHOD ...................................................................................................................................... 37

2.2.1 Sampling .................................................................................................................................. 37

2.2.2 Content Analysis ......................................................................................................................... 43

2.2.3 Discourse analysis ....................................................................................................................... 45

2.3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ................................................................................................ 46

2.3.1 Content and Context .................................................................................................................. 46

2.3.2 The Frames and Research Questions ......................................................................................... 48

CHAPTER 3 NATIONAL INTEREST INFLUENCES MEDIA DISCOURSE ......................................... 50

3.1 GLOBALIZATION, STATE AND NATIONAL INTEREST ........................................................... 51

3.1.1 Impingements of Globalization on the State ............................................................................ 51

3.1.2 Comparing China and India in the Neo-Liberal World ........................................................... 53
6.3.3 India: Pragmatism in the Bilateral Relations .................................................................151
6.4 The Other Countries in the Chinese and Indian Media.......................................................158
6.5 Summary ..........................................................................................................................159

CHAPTER 7 CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION ........................................................................161

7.1 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION .........................................................................................161
7.2 CONTRIBUTIONS OF THIS STUDY .................................................................................164
7.3 LIMITATIONS AND FURTHER STUDIES .......................................................................166

APPENDIX I KEYWORDS OF GLOBALIZATION .....................................................................169
APPENDIX II CONTENT ANALYSIS CODING SHEET ................................................................171
REFERENCES .........................................................................................................................174
List of Tables and Figures

TABLE 1-1 NATIONAL PROFILE OF CHINA AND INDIA (1999-2000) ................................................................. 11
TABLE 1-2 WORLD’S IMPORTANT ECONOMIES BY GDP ................................................................................ 14
TABLE 1-3 CHINA’S INTERNAL VERSIONS OF GLOBALIZATION ................................................................. 16
TABLE 1-4 INDIA’S INTERNAL VERSIONS OF GLOBALIZATION ................................................................. 17
TABLE 2-1 OUTLINE OF THE TWO FRAMES IN THE CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA (%) ............................ 37
TABLE 2-2 CATEGORIES IN THE CONTENT ANALYSIS ..................................................................................... 44
TABLE 3-1 MEANS OF MAIN ECONOMIC INDICATORS OF CHINA AND INDIA (1996-2006) ..................... 54
TABLE 3-2 MEMBERSHIP IN MAIN INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS ....................... 56
TABLE 3-3 GENERAL DIFFERENCES IN THE CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA ............................................ 58
TABLE 3-4 THE FOCUS OF CONCERN OF NEWS COVERAGE IN CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA (%) ............ 59
TABLE 3-5 TYPES OF ISSUES CONCERNED BY CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA (%) ..................................... 60
TABLE 3-6 OVERALL ATTITUDES TOWARDS GLOBALIZATION BY CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA (%) .... 62
TABLE 3-7 SUPPORT FOR DIFFERENT ISSUES (%) ........................................................................................ 62
TABLE 3-8 OPPOSITION TO DIFFERENT ISSUES (%) ....................................................................................... 62
TABLE 3-9 OVERALL ATTITUDES TOWARDS GLOBALIZATION OVER TIME (%) .......................................... 63
TABLE 3-10 THE WINNER-OR-LOSERS ISSUES IN CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA DISCOURSES ................ 68
TABLE 3-11 PERCEIVED BENEFITS FROM THE WTO IN THE CHINESE AND INDIAN MEDIA (%) ............... 71
TABLE 3-12 PERCEIVED COSTS IN THE WTO (%) ........................................................................................ 72
TABLE 3-13 MEDIA COVERAGE ON ECONOMY AND ACTUAL ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE .................... 73
TABLE 3-14 BENEFITS AND COSTS ON THREE LEVELS (%) ............................................................................ 74
TABLE 4-1 PERCENTAGES OF SOCIAL CONFLICT CONSTRUCTION ............................................................ 85
TABLE 4-2 GENERAL DIFFERENCES IN CONFLICT CONSTRUCTION .......................................................... 85
TABLE 4-3 THE BACKGROUND OF AUTHORS ................................................................................................. 86
TABLE 4-4 TYPES OF SOCIAL CONFLICT ........................................................................................................ 92
TABLE 4-5 WAYS OF REPRESENTING SOCIAL CONFLICTS ............................................................................. 98
TABLE 4-6 THE RANK OF KEYWORDS USED IN ALL NATIONAL PARTY CONGRESS REPORTS .................. 101
TABLE 5-1 THE HISTORICAL FIGURES USED IN CHINESE AND INDIAN NEWSPAPERS ............................ 111
TABLE 6-1 GENERAL DIFFERENCES IN FREQUENCIES OF “THE OTHERS” (PER ARTICLE) ....................... 140
TABLE 6-2 GENERAL DIFFERENCES IN ATTITUDE TOWARDS “THE OTHERS” (%) ................................... 141
TABLE 6-3 CHINESE MEDIA DISCOURSE ON THE U.S. (N=139) ............................................................... 150
TABLE 6-4 INDIAN MEDIA DISCOURSE ON THE U.S. (N=61) .................................................................... 156
TABLE 6-5 AMOUNT OF ATTENTION CHINA AND INDIA PAID TO EACH OTHER IN MEDIA ................. 159