

趙嬷嬷說英語

——論霍譯本《石頭記》中的 idiolect

洪濤

引言

《紅樓夢》(又名《石頭記》)的霍克思譯本,語域變幅甚大,譯者顯然在這方面下過工夫,非常值得注意。¹筆者曾經勾出一些翻譯特徵以供學譯者參考,並評論霍譯的得失。筆者的〈劉姥姥說英語——略論紅樓夢英譯中的語言變化〉一文比較詳細地分析了霍譯本中劉姥姥的談吐特點,結論是劉姥姥「說英語」頗有社會方言的色彩。²《紅樓夢》中另一位老婦人趙嬷嬷雖只出場一次,卻說話甚多,有喧賓奪主之勢。在霍譯本中,Nannie Zhao(趙嬷嬷)的「表現」或「表演」更是洋洋灑灑、生動傳神。從下文的分析,我們可以看出霍克思如何調動英語的資源(target language resources)來翻譯老婦人的吐屬、聲口,譯文塑造出一種個人方言(idiolect)。³

趙嬷嬷是賈府管事人賈璉的乳母,年事已高。⁴第十六回寫趙嬷嬷來賈璉和鳳姐屋子裡為她的兒子謀求差事。賈璉之妻鳳姐殷勤招待趙嬷嬷:「媽媽,你嘗一嘗你兒子[賈璉]帶來的惠泉酒。」趙嬷嬷道:「我喝呢!奶奶也喝一鐘,怕什麼?只不要過多了就是了。我這會子跑了來,倒也不為酒飯,倒有一件正經事,奶奶好歹記在心裏,疼顧我些罷。我們這爺,只是嘴裏說的好,到了跟前就忘了我們。幸虧我從小兒奶了你這麼大。我也老了,有的是那兩個兒子,你就另眼照看他們些,別人也不敢吡牙兒的。我還再三的求了你幾遍,你答應的倒好,到如今還是落空。這如今又從天上跑出這一件大喜事[王妃回家省親]來,那裏用不著人?所以倒是來和奶奶來說是正經,

靠著我們爺,只怕我還餓死了呢。」(舊.1.179)趙嬷嬷這一番話,基本上是希望賈璉關照她的兒子,她抱怨主子賈璉早就口頭答應,卻久久沒有實際行動。

霍譯本中趙嬷嬷所用的詞語

趙嬷嬷自恃功高,要求回報:「幸虧我從小兒奶了你這麼大。我也老了,有的是那兩個兒子,你就另眼照看他們些,別人也不敢吡牙兒的。」霍克思翻譯為: And a fine young man you've growed into, thanks be! Well, I'm old and of no account now.

But there are these two sons of mine, d'ye see? If only you would be more like a foster-brother to them and look after them a bit, no one would dare say a word agen them. (霍.1.311)

按照正規英語,grow的過去式應該是grew。現在霍克思卻讓趙嬷嬷說成growed。原來這個growed不是霍克思憑空炮製。按照《牛津英語詞典》OED的說明,growed是dial. & colloq. (濤按:dial. = dialectal)。換言之,即「方言和口語體」。具體例子,可以引Charles Dickens(1812-1870)的David Copperfield為證,該書Chapter 7:

Mr. Peggotty (who never shut his mouth once, I remember, during the visit) showed great concern when he saw me do this, and nudged Ham to say something.

“Cheer up, Mas’r Davy bor’!” said Ham, in his simpering way. “Why, how you have growed!”

“Am I grown?” I said, drying my eyes. I was not crying at anything particular that I know of; but somehow it made me cry, to see old friends.

“Growed, Mas’r Davy bor’! Ain’t he growed?” said Ham.

“Ain’t he growed!” said Mr. Peggotty.

在 *David Copperfield* 中，Mr. Peggotty 和 Ham Peggotty 都屬低下階層，所受的教育不多，因此，他們說話不標準。趙嫵嫵在賈府也是奴僕，霍克思的做法，與狄更斯 (Dickens) 的寫法相仿。(也許 Hawkes 參考過 Dickens 的著作?)

至於「你就另眼照看他們些，別人也不敢吡牙兒的」一句，霍克思譯為 *If only you would be more like a foster-brother to them and look after them a bit, no one would dare say a word agen them.* 霍譯本中的 *agen*，按照 N. F. Blake 在 *Non-standard Language in English Literature* 所說，是一種異拼法：*again(st)* 可拼成 *agean*。⁵ 實際上也有拼作 *agen* 的，我們可以引 Charles Dickens 的 *Great Expectations* 為證。引文較長，因為從上下文可見說話之人，滿口非標準英語：‘*This is the way it was, that when I was a ragged little creetur as much to be pitied as ever I see (not that I looked in the glass, for there warn’t many insides of furnished houses known to me), I got the name of being hardened. “This is a terrible hardened one,” they says to prison wisitors, picking out me. “May be said to live in jails, this boy.” Then they looked at me, and I looked at them, and they measured my head, some on’em—they had better a measured*

*my stomach—and others on’em giv me tracts what I couldn’t read, and made me speeches what I couldn’t understand. They always went on agen me about the Devil. But what the Devil was I to do? I must put something into my stomach, mustn’t I?—Howsomever, I’m a getting low... .*⁶

另一部狄更斯作品《小杜麗》*Little Dorrit* 也有一個例子：‘*She is very delicate and inexperienced indeed.*’ ‘*That,*’ said the turkey, ‘*is agen her.*’ (Chapter 6)⁷ 霍克思用這個 *agen*，相信也是作為 *non-standard English* 來用的。

除了詞匯不甚 *standard* 外，譯本中趙嫵嫵的談吐也顯得較「舊式」。她剛坐下不久就勸鳳姐也喝酒：「怕什麼？只不要過多了就是了。」霍克思譯為 *As long as you don’t drink too much, ‘twill do you good. But I didn’t come all the way here for vittles and drinks, bless you.* 後來趙嫵嫵又說「拿著皇帝家的銀子往皇帝身上使罷了。」霍克思譯為 ‘*Twere no more than paying for the Emperor’s entertainment with the Emperor’s own silver.*’ (霍.1.315) 我們可以分析一下這些譯文的詞語：‘*Twere* 之類簡縮形態，按《牛津英語詞典》的說明，或屬 *archaic*，或屬 *dialectal*；莎士比亞戲劇中常常見到。⁸

至於趙嫵嫵說的 *Vittles and drinks*，其中 *vittles* 是古語，指「食物」。《*The New Oxford Dictionary of English*》指出：*Vittle* 是 *archaic*，並說明該詞是 *variant spelling of VICTUAL*。(濤按：*victual* 即食物。)

我們猜想，因為趙嫵嫵年事已高，所以霍克思就讓她說話時帶些古舊的氣息。換言之，譯文透露出人物語言 *age-grading* (年齡差異) 的痕跡。⁹ 這一點，在《紅樓夢》原文中，似乎不很明顯。換言之，霍譯是翻譯作品，卻甚具創意 (*creative*)。

霍譯本中趙嬈嬈所用的句式

第十六回稍後，趙嬈嬈談到賈妃要歸省，賈府要接駕的事，因此又聯想到二三十年前賈家接駕的事（接皇帝的御駕）。趙嬈嬈顯得很興奮，倚老賣老滔滔不絕地發表她的「經驗之談」：

趙嬈嬈道：「噯喲！那可是千載難逢的！那時候我才記事兒。咱們賈府正在姑蘇揚州一帶監造海船，修理海塘，只預備接駕一次，把銀子花的像淌海水似的！說起來——」（舊.1.181）

‘That’s the sort of thing that scarce comes once in a thousand years! I was not so young then that I can’t still remember. [...] The way they spend silver on that visit, why, it was like pouring out salt sea water! I call to mind...’ (霍.1.314)

霍克思看來有意按照趙嬈嬈的身份和口吻來組織譯文。這短短的一段，已可以看出霍克思用了兩種比較特殊的句式：double negative 和 anticipated identification。

先看double negative。趙嬈嬈說「那時候我才記事兒」，霍克思譯為“I was not so young then that I can’t still remember.”（直譯：我當時年齡不小了，所以當時的事我不記得。）這一句式，是一個「雙重否定句」（double negative）。較正規的說法，應該是“I was not so young then that I can still remember.”（我當時年齡不小了，當時的事我還記得。）¹⁰按照prescriptive grammatical tradition，雙重否定句是不足為訓的。在正常情況下，一般受過高等教育的人不會隨便使用易生歧義的雙重否定句。狄更斯小說中Bleak House中街道清潔工就曾多次使用雙重否定句。The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language指negative concord是「非標準英語」：Those

who claim that negative concord is evidence of ignorance and illiteracy are wrong; it is a regular and widespread feature of non-standard dialects of English across the world.¹¹

其次，再看anticipated identification，霍譯本中的例子有 The way they spend silver on that visit, why, it was like pouring out salt sea water. 這一句譯原文的「把銀子花的像淌海水的似的」。¹²這種英語結構，叫做“anticipated identification”（又稱為“left dislocation”），做法是把一個名詞短語前移到句首，而在它原來的位置放進一個加強代詞（proxy），充當它的「代表」。這種結構常見於非正式（informal）口語。¹³再往下看，我們還可以發現霍譯本中其他informal的話：

「[……]那是誰不知道的？如今還有個俗話兒呢，說『東海少了白玉床，龍王來請金陵王。』這說的就是奶奶府上了。還有如今現在江南的甄家，噯喲！好勢派！獨他家接駕四次。要不是我們親眼看見，告訴誰也不信的。別講銀子成了糞土，憑是世上有的，沒有不是堆山積海的。『罪過可惜』四個字顧不得了！」（舊.1.182）

‘Everybody knows that,’ said Nannie Zhao. ‘There’s even a rhyme about it: ... That’s your family: the “Nanking Wangs”. But then there’s the Zhens, who still live down that way in Kiangnan. My word! There’s riches for you! That family alone received the Emperor *four times!*

If I hadn’t seen with my own two eyes, I don’t care who told me, I wouldn’t have credited it, the sights I saw then! Never mind silver. Silver was just dirt to them. Every precious thing in the world you can think of they had there in mountains!

Words like “save” and “spare” they just didn’t seem to know the meaning of!
(霍.1.314)

譯文中有口語化的片語如 my word, thanks be, d’ye see¹⁴、重讀腔口 (stressed, e.g. four times), 這些都是英語口語的典型特徵。

句式方面，霍譯多方面顯示出非正式的口吻，如 There’s the Zhens, There’s the riches for you! 從語法的agreement/concord方面考慮，這些都是口語化的說法。¹⁵其次，譯本中的一連串感嘆句、一連串的短句 (If I hadn’t seen with my own two eyes, I don’t care who told me, I wouldn’t have credited it, the sights I saw then! Never mind silver. Silver was just dirt to them.) 等，將一個年邁婦人好談舊事、嘮嘮叨叨的口吻描繪得栩栩如生。另外一種句法手段同樣也有informal的作用，這種句法手段可稱為object foregrounding，或者是fronting：

–Every precious thing in the world you can think of they had there in mountains! (霍.1.314)

–Words like “save” and “spare” they just didn’t seem to know the meaning of.
(霍.1.314)

“Fronting” (提前) 表示把一個詞項從它通常的位置移到句首位置，以求突出主位 (marked theme)。這類說法具有明顯的非正式 (informal) 風格，似乎說話者腦子裡想起的首要東西是主位成分，其餘成分只是事後想到而補充在後面的。Quirk, Greenbaum, Leech, Svartvik 等人合撰的 *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language* 指 Fronting 也有 a distinctly informal flavour...¹⁶。霍克思的目的，大概也是表現 informal flavour。

按照discourse analysis的說法，topic 是 old information，focus 是 new information，並認為

在英語及其他大多數的語言裡，old information always precedes new information in unmarked constructions。¹⁷ 然而，在 marked context 下，句子的語序是 focus/new information—topic/old information。譯文裡的 Nannie Zhao 唸 The way they spend silver on that visit / Every precious thing in the world you can think of / Words like “save” and “spare” 時，非以重讀腔口來唸不可。*Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English* 指 core elements 的提前在現代英語中並非常態，但 Conversation and fiction, by contrast, strive for greater impact and stylistic effect, so we find types of fronting which chiefly convey special emphasis and contract—especially fronting of objects but also some fronting of predicatives.¹⁸ 由此觀之，譯本中趙嫵嫵說的話，具有一種語調特徵，加強了口語的效果。

結語

從以上的分析，我們可以歸納出霍克思的翻譯手段。霍譯本中趙嫵嫵的話，有以下幾個特點：在詞匯方面，她的話中有一些是 non-standard, old-fashioned (甚至是 archaic) 的詞語。這一點應該是為了配合她的奴僕身份和年齡因素。

句式方面，她的話極具口語的非正式色彩，其中尤其多口頭俗話 (colloquial, informal expressions)。這一點，相信是為了配合她老人家絮絮叨叨、興奮雀躍的言談特色。

在趙嫵嫵的年齡、社會身份、話語方式 (mode of discourse) 等因素的交相作用下，她的話體現出一種個人特色，可稱為「個人方言」(idiolect)。本文的小標題「趙嫵嫵所用的詞語」、「趙嫵嫵所用的句式」，實際上當然都是「霍克思所用的……」，由此觀之，霍克思比較接近於譯學中的「操控學派」(the manipulation school)¹⁹。

簡言之，霍克思的譯文，在表現人物口吻方面，不比原文遜色，甚至可以說是比原文更有特色。霍克思怎麼做到這種翻譯效果？答案是 purposeful selection of target language resources. (附記：筆者撰有一系列關於《紅樓夢》英譯本的研究報告，準備彙成《紅樓夢英譯評議》系列。本文係短篇劄記，屬《紅樓夢翻譯與社會語言學》的一部分。)

註釋：

1. 「霍克思譯本」指David Hawkes的譯作 *The Story of the Stone* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Book Ltd., 1973-1980)。本文中(霍.1.311)即指「霍譯本，第1冊，第311頁」。餘可類推。
2. 洪濤：〈劉姥姥說英語〉，載於《城大文學》第6期(2004年9月30日)，頁122-124。
3. J. C. Catford將idiolect 定義為 “the language variety used by a particular individual.” 參看Catford, *A Linguistic Theory of Translation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1965), p.86.
4. 趙嬾嬾的具體歲數不詳，書中沒有寫清楚。但書中明寫鳳姐擔心她年老嚼不動肴饌。(舊.1.179) 濤按：(舊.1.179)指《紅樓夢》的「舊行本，第1冊，第179頁」。學術界稱《紅樓夢》(北京：人民文學出版社，1964)為「舊行本」。
5. Norman Francis Blake, *Non-standard Language in English Literature* (London: Deutsch, 1981) p.150.
6. Charles Dickens, *Great Expectations* (London: Oxford University Press, 1953), p.328.
7. Charles Dickens, *Little Dorrit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1953), p.58.
8. 參看Kirsti Peitsara, “Variants of contraction: The case of it’ s and ‘tis”, *ICAME Journal* 28 (2004), pp.77-94.
9. 參看Charles F. Hockett, “Age-grading and Linguistic Continuity”, *Language: Journal of the Linguistic Society of America* 26 (1950), pp. 449-459.
10. 楊憲益夫婦的譯本作：I was just old enough then to remember things. (楊.1.210) 可資參考。
11. Rodney Huddleston & Geoffrey K. Pullum, *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp.844-847.
12. 楊譯本的句式沒有什麼特別之處：we spent money like pouring out sea-water. (楊.1.210)
13. Randolph Quirk, et al., *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language* (London: Longman, 1985), p.1310: “In informal spoken English we also have the reverse process, ‘anticipated identification’, where a noun phrase is positioned initially and a reinforcing pronoun stands ‘proxy’ for it in the relevant position in the sentence.”
14. Thanks be, d’ye see 二例，例於本文第二節的引文。
15. 參看Douglas Biber, et al., *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English* (Harlow: Longman, 1999), “Concord with existential there”, p.185: “In conversation, however, we frequently find a singular form of be followed by plural noun phrases. The verb is regularly contracted and attached to the preceding there...”
16. R. Quick, et al., *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*, 18.20, p.1377.
17. 參考B. Hatim & I. Mason, *Discourse and the Translator* (London: Longman, 1990), p.215.
18. Douglas Biber, et al., *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English* (Harlow: Longman, 1999), p.910.
19. 這裡主要是指語言層面上的 manipulation。西方的the manipulation school以文化大背景、意識形態等宏觀層面為研究和論述重點。
20. 參看Albrecht Neubert & Gregory M. Shreve, *Translation as Text* (Kent, Ohio: Kent State University Press, 1992), p.23。

(校對：倪明威、黃海星)